

Beyond technology-based customer relationship management: It is total customer experience management

Noor Raihan Ab Hamid
Universiti Tun Abdul Razak

Romiza Md Akhir
UNITAR International University

ABSTRACT

Companies have experimented with Customer Relationship Management (CRM), which in most cases involve the implementation of technology-based CRM – CRM system. However, despite hefty investments in the system many have reported the initiatives failed to deliver the results as expected. Recently, there is a growing concern that in order to gain customer loyalty companies have to rethink beyond the technological solution. The focus has shifted from managing customer relationship to managing total customer experience. By far, although companies capture customers' data not many analyse those data and fewer companies end up offering preferred services to different groups of customers. Moreover, the challenge escalates as now customers interact with the service providers through multi-channels. This study aimed to examine the reality of CRM practices by hoteliers and how these activities actually appeal to customers' emotions towards a better total customer experience. Using structured observation method this research examined a set of elements against the real practices by hoteliers. This study reported that the levels of integrated CRM practices affording enhanced customer experience differ among hotels. Finally this study presented the limitations of study and proposed some future directions of research.

Keywords: customer relationship management, customer experience, hotel industry, systems.

INTRODUCTION

Driven by customer economics, for many years companies have implemented Customer Relationship Management (CRM) programme. Commonly, CRM initiatives involve, among others, the establishment of CRM strategy in support of the overall business strategy, the sales and marketing department or equivalent as the owner of the project, and an investment in a CRM system. Through good coordination and synergy between these three elements it is believed that CRM would deliver its promises - increased customer loyalty and better profitability. Enthusiastic about the business value of CRM, most large companies often roll out CRM projects involving hefty investment in acquiring CRM system, which some considered as the backbone of the CRM initiative.

The primary objective of CRM is to gain better understanding of customers' preferences and offering higher quality of services leading to customer loyalty. The use of CRM system such as data warehousing and mining, call centre, online order tracking, personalized services, multi-channel ordering system and so forth would seem to be the right tools to deliver the expected results. For example, apart from collecting massive customers data, the technology-based CRM should be able to analyse customer behaviour, identify customers segment and analyse trends which will provide meaningful information for planning the marketing campaigns. In addition, the CRM system is also applicable in the sales function where customers can conveniently place orders 24/7 through the self service online features. The sales force who are out in the field prospecting for new customers can immediately response to ad-hoc requests when they are connected to the real time information. Apparently, the technology-based CRM may deliver expected results should the system implementation is efficiently and effectively carried out.

However, in the recent years there were growing concerns from the industries on the CRM programme failures. Researchers and practitioners argued that the failure was not due to technology incapability alone, but companies lack strategic thinking of leveraging on the wealth of customers information and processes, and turning them into better customer experience (Jacques, 2012; Heckmann et al., 2012). In fact, CRM should not be too technology-oriented without relating to customers' "software" i.e their emotions (Ab Hamid et al., 2005) as the features that appeal to customers' emotions can provide better customer experience leading to higher retention rates (Markwick, 2006).

This paper presents a study on examining CRM initiatives by hotel industry. In light of understanding an integrated approach to technology-based CRM this study applied a qualitative method and aimed at assessing the implementation of an integrated CRM by selected hotels in Kuala Lumpur which may lead to better total customer experience.

CUSTOMER RELATIONSHIP MANAGEMENT (CRM) AS A BUILDING BLOCK TO ENHANCING TOTAL CUSTOMER EXPERIENCE

To many, CRM initiatives would entail investing considerably in installing the CRM system software and other related processes where inter-connected departments would be re-designed alongside with the technology-based CRM. In reality, the reengineering of processes is an uphill task and many reported shortfalls associated with non-integrated processes. As a result, CRM programme which does not only involve technology rather a customer-centric business strategy focusing on giving excellent customers experience failed to deliver its promises. Consequently, many argue that in order to enhance customer relationship companies need to emphasize on services that appeal to customers emotions, that is, the service attributes that make customers feel they are treated well enough to attract them to keep coming back (Anonymous, 2006).

In particular, academics and industries alike have shifted their focus from merely investigating the impact of CRM system to Customer Experience Management, also known as CEM. Ab Hamid and Khatibi (2007) suggest in a service-based economy, the focus has been transformed into an attention economy (Davenport & Beck, 2002), entertainment economy (Wolf, 1999), emotion economy (Gobe & Zyman, 2001) or an experience economy (Schmitt, 1999). As many of service offerings have been commoditized, it is advisable that firms seek new ways to achieve competitive advantage by focusing on management of customers' experiences (Pullman & Gross, 2004).

Customer experience has been defined as the quality of event that accounts for anticipation, emotional involvement, a uniqueness that makes the aforementioned stand out from the ordinary, and reaches some form of completion (Dewey, 1963). In addition, Price et al. (1995) suggest that extraordinary experiences are those activities characterized by high levels of emotional intensity which is usually triggered by an unusual event. The goal of providing such experience is to orchestrate experiences that are functional, purposeful, engaging compelling and memorable (McLellan, 2000). Hence, properly executed experience management will induce sense of loyalty not only through a functional design but also by creating emotional connection through engaging, compelling and consistent context (Ab Hamid & Khatibi, 2007; Pullman & Gross, 2004). Those elements regarded as appealing to customers' emotions, or known as emotional appeal elements, affording better total customer experience are discussed in the next section.

Multi-Channel Integration Imperatives in Managing Total Customer Experience.

Today's business environment calls for companies to aggressively take advantage of multi-channel communication as the contact points with customers. With the advancement of technology, customers have various options to get updated information and compare service features via the web sites, social media such as the facebook and twitter as well as through other mobile applications. Although there are growing interests from the industry to implement cross-channel sales and marketing campaigns a report conducted in United Kingdom by Pitney Bowes indicated that "90% of companies want their channels integrated but only 31% actually do so" (Brandweiner, 2012).

Previous studies proposed that the absence of integration in hybrid retail strategies will result in inconsistent and unsatisfactory customer experiences, which will not make any online business successful (Bradshaw & Brash 2001). For example, Barnes & Noble's inconsistency has sacrificed more than it gained by divorcing its online business from its established traditional stores (Gulati & Garino 2000).

In particular, for click-and-mortar companies, integration of operations across channels is crucial to ensure continuous customer relationships in all channels (Jacques, 2012). This is because customers want to be able to deal with companies as single entities (Bradshaw & Brash 2001; Heckmann et al., 2012). They also expect to get the same customer service level via all channels (Croen, 2001). Thus, to provide consistent customer experience, every customer's details should be shared in a common database and accessible directly by the multi-channels (Ab Hamid & McGrath, 2005). In fact, Xu et al. (2002) point out that the integrated systems provide the highest quality and most timely information. Indeed, the more data a company gets the more accurate the company can be in terms of what it recommends to the customers and how it communicates with them (Ab Hamid & Khatibi, 2007). This may lead to building good customer relationship (Yakhlef, 2001).

- a) Consistency in message and experience (Brandweiner, 2012).

One of the important elements in channel integration is the companies' ability to ensure that the same message is delivered across communication channels. Indeed, when customers have made reservation from the web site by giving away his/her personal and credit card information he/she would expect the actual service rendered would match what was promised on the hotel's web site. In the event that customers did not get the same level of service as presented on another channel, quickly the inconsistency would lead to frustration and disconfirmation of expectation.

b) Integrated CRM system

The information technology functions have evolved from merely managing information to knowing what information is available and how information can be used to enhance customer experience (Huseby et al., 2012). The major drawback is when the system is working in silos. An integrated CRM system involves storing customers' transactions data, analyzing them and sharing the information across all customer contact points as to enable cross- channel sales (Huseby et al., 2012).

For example, when hotel guests register at the front-desk they expect that the representative would know all the reservation details from the check-in/check-out date, room type to special services as requested via the online reservation and confirmed by the email sent by the hotel. Therefore, capturing, tracking and sharing customers' transactions data across channels are critical. With the integrated system, both online and offline customer databases are merged. James (2000) claims that this integration allows the companies to access more data about a customer's preferences and purchase history. In this way, customers will have no need to repetitively provide the same information (Ab Hamid & Khatibi, 2007).

c) Value-adding services

The ultimate aim of a technology-based CRM is gaining customer loyalty. However, companies are often trapped in the beliefs that CRM system is a silver bullet to forging long-term relationships with customers. Apparently, bonding creation requires further than mere technological solutions – it is an emotional relationship (Davey, 2011) which builds on accumulated pleasant experiences. These experiences, primarily among others, involve encounters perceived as value-added services, commonly exceeding customers' expectations and memorable.

It is such emotional elements that can influence customers' attitude and affording their loyalty. Obviously, a customer who is offered a service better than what he/she expected (perceived value-added service) is elated by the experience and looking forward to return for more value-added services, and a customer who has not gained any excitement from the first service encounter would be less motivated to return.

RESEARCH METHODS

Drawn from previous studies, this research has identified several elements of an integrated CRM practices which should be present in order to deliver better customer experience. Table 1 (see Appendix) shows three major categories, elements and features of each category.

Structured Observation Method

The purpose of this study is to ascertain the extent to which the salient features of integrated CRM- consistency, integrated CRM system and value-adding services are contributing to total customer experience. As the extant literature lacks clear categorization of and theories on how CRM initiatives could influence customers' total experience from the hotel industry perspective a structured observation technique is deemed appropriate. This field-work method of data collection seeks to reveal the reality (Wilson, nd) of CRM exercise – CRM in action by hoteliers and the potential impact on customer emotions and experience. Guided by a set of variables from past studies the observation items were predetermined which were then used to record physical and verbal behavior (Muhalla, 2003). Table 2 (see Appendix) depicts the elements and observed items used for this research.

The selection of hotels was made solely based on convenience. Based on a study conducted by Ab Hamid et al. (2011) on E-CRM practices by hoteliers in major cities in Malaysia, a majority of four and five star hotels reported as having some elements of CRM on the hotels' web sites. Most of these hotels are located in the Kuala Lumpur, the capitol of Malaysia. Five hotels were selected: 1 four-star hotel; 3 five-star hotels; 1 six-star hotel and the hotels are located in Kuala Lumpur.

Data Collection

As described in the previous section, this research adopted the structured observation method of collecting data. The field-work began with making reservations to all hotels made two weeks prior to a visit. To ensure consistency of data being observed one researcher has been assigned to carry out the field-work at all selected hotels.

Pre-visit:

Information pertaining to the hotel – ambience, facilities; and room package – amenities, promotional items were recorded and checked against the information given by the reservation confirmation email. Communication between the hotel and guest prior to the actual visit was observed.

During the visit:

The observed items included information retrieval and tracking historical transactions; consistency of message and experience checked against what were described in the hotels' web sites; elements of pleasant surprise offered by the hotel.

Post-visit:

After the hotel stay, communication between each hotel and the guest was observed for any marketing campaigns calling for repeat visits or cross-selling.

Structured Observation of Selected Hotels

This section reports in detail the field-work carried out at the selected hotels within six months.

Hotel A

Hotel A is situated in the heart of the “golden triangle” in Kuala Lumpur metropolitan city. Its strategic location, which is very close to a renowned convention centre and surrounded by restaurants, bars, clubs and cafés has afforded the hotel to be one of the perfect accommodation of choice for business travelers. The four-star hotel ambience appeals to savvy and professional guests who would enjoy the stay for work, rest and play.

Upon confirmation of room reservation via the hotel’s web site, an automated email was received. The email listed out the basic reservation details such as guest name, contact number, address, check-in and check-out date, room type and preferences. In addition, information on special promotion offers in the form of cash vouchers at designated shopping outlets was parallel to the information given on the web site.

At the check-in counter, the representative welcomed the researcher in a warm and professional manner. He had asked for the reservation number and customer’s ID and then checked against the hotel’s reservation system. Apart from obtaining confirmation on the check-in/out dates and room type the receptionist had asked for room preference – smoking or non-smoking; executive or non-executive floor. Although the confirmation of reservation print-out had stated the room preference i.e. non-smoking the information seemed to have not been captured in the front-end system. On the type of floor the researcher had chosen the non-executive.

The guest room had all the facilities and amenities as described in the web site. In addition, promotional items such as the cash and discount vouchers were available. Walking in to dine at any of the hotel restaurants was easy as the room number can be tracked down at the front-desk system and hence all related bill payments can be made at a single point i.e. the front-desk. Subsequent to the visit, the researcher received an email signed by the hotel manager as a mean to express appreciation and welcomed feedback from the hotel guests.

One of the important features of a technology-based CRM is the extent to which customers’ data are captured and subsequently using customers past transactions as the basis to uniquely serve the customers in their return visits. To meet the research objectives, in this study repeat visit is deemed necessary. Therefore, a second visit to the hotel was done two months after the first visit.

The same reservation process as in the first attempt was undertaken. At the check-in counter, once again the receptionist had asked for the room type and preference. When asked whether or not the researcher’s information during the first visit was captured in the system the front-desk officer replied,

“No, we do not keep the data in the system”.

Although this was a repeat visit, tracking of customers’ transaction history was not evident nor was the customer service proactive in offering customers to sign up in the hotel’s loyalty programme. Apparently, the information on the loyalty programme would only be available upon customer’s request.

Hotel B

Hotel B is located within Kuala Lumpur city centre and offers newly re-furnished rooms including high-speed technology. Featured as one of the top five-star hotels in the city, Hotel B is a member of one of the world’s largest hotel group.

The reservation page design was simple yet informative. The indicator bar at the top of the reservation page was convenient as the potential guests would know all the stages involved prior to making reservations with their credit cards. Upon reservation, the hotel sent out a confirmation email providing the reservation details.

At the registration counter, the customer service representative had asked for the guest's ID. The representative appeared friendly and professional. Upon checking the reservation which was done via the hotel's web site the representative handed over the keys and asked if the researcher would be interested to sign-up for the hotel group loyalty programme. Without hesitation, the researcher accepted the offer and the application could be submitted either online or offline (at the counter).

The room amenities were as described by the web site. Guests could use any facilities in the hotel including dining at one of the hotel's restaurants with ease as all the billing can be tracked at the front-desk. The researcher filled up the loyalty programme online application and received the membership confirmation a few days after. Following the subscription, emails on worldwide promotions were sent out on a regular basis and mostly matched the researcher's interests.

Hotel C

Located in the satellite city of Petaling Jaya, this five-star hotel prided its hospitality service on providing grandeur and elegance in an atmosphere of urban residential comfort. Adjoining to the hotel is one of the most successful shopping centres in the country which adds up its score in terms of customers' convenience. The hotel is a member of a hotel group which has the longest established Europe-based of independent hotels and regional brands worldwide.

One of the service quality enhancement initiatives introduced by the hotel is the one-stop service centre. If any customer requests for housekeeping, maintenance, food and beverage or concierge he/she would only need to call the Customer Service number, which will then relay the request to the respective departments. By having a coordinated system, customers' requests can be solved in a timely manner. As recognition of its service, the hotel won numerous awards amongst, The Asia Pacific Hotel Awards and TripAdvisor Traveller's Choice Award.

The hotel's online reservation process was reasonably simple. Interestingly, there was a link to Special Offers whereby guests who reserved a two-night weekend stay would be entitled to a discounted rate for the in-room spa service. The promotion was limited only to reservations made via the hotel's web site. The researcher had chosen the Special Offer. Upon submitting the reservation, the hotel sent out an automated email on confirmation of room reservation which provided the basic reservation details including room type and preference of smoking/non smoking room, and the entitlement to the discounted in-room spa service.

The check-in counter was placed at an ample space and several counters were opened which eased the registration flow. At the registration counter, guest reservation data were retrieved based on the customer's ID. The representative seemed to be able to view information on guest reservation i.e. check-in/out date, room type and preference. However, when asked about the promotional discount on the in-room spa service, the representative indicated that the reservation was not entitled to such offer. When the researcher showed the information printed in the confirmation email which stated otherwise, the representative insisted the front-service system did not show the offer was available.

Immediately, the experience shaped a negative impression on the five-star hotel's service – the information about reservation, guests' requests and entitlement was not well captured by both communication channels and customers could not rely on the information provided. Obviously, such incident had caused dissatisfaction and adversely affected the researcher's total experience with the hotel.

A follow-up visit was conducted three months after the first visit. Having gone through the same reservation process and with the same selected room package the second visit also provided an unsatisfactory experience where the promotional discount was not available during the stay.

Hotel D

Designed to give an authentic and contemporary experience to hotel guests, Hotel D is situated in the bustling city of Kuala Lumpur city centre. It takes pride on its establishment for more than 50 years and the strong brand name as the global industry leader. The hotel, which pleads to offer a pleasant corporate hospitality, also received numerous awards, one of which is the TripAdvisor Certificate of Excellence Award.

One of the services the hotel offers is guests may make requests prior to their arrivals and the room will be prepared uniquely to meet the specific needs. Its presence covers more than 60 countries worldwide and the hotel boasts on its ability to track customers' record locally, where the customers check-in. In addition, through its loyalty programme, customers are able to convert guest-points into charitable assistance to those in need.

The hotel's web site was simple yet reflected the class of a long established branded hotel worldwide. Guests were given the options to select extra services such as the executive limousine service, dining in an exclusive restaurant, as well as the Welcoming service such as a choice of in-room bouquet of flowers, chocolate or fruit basket. Common with other hotels' online reservation, an automated email was sent out confirming the reservation details. In addition, Hotel D sent out another email, signed by the hotel manager a few days prior to the guests' arrival welcoming the guests, as well as offering other services which would complement the hotel stay – in-room massage, spa, city tour and so forth.

As described in the hotel's web site the hotel ambience was modern yet exclusive and appropriately designed to appeal to its target customers – corporate guests. At the check-in counter, the hotel's much popularized loyalty programme information was conveniently visible to the hotel guests and the application could be done online and offline. The researcher chose to fill up the application form manually. After several days the researcher received a confirmation email on the membership. Thereafter, the hotel continually sent promotional emails.

The guest room was equipped with the facilities and amenities as expressed in the web site and satisfactorily met the researcher's expectation.

Hotel E

Hotel E is located next to a global tourist attraction - a shopping mall in Kuala Lumpur city centre. It offers more than 600 rooms with spectacular view of the city with a combination of comfort and luxury ambience. Featured as a six-star, Hotel E has strong international presence and carries its established brand in more than 20 major cities worldwide including New York, Paris, Munich, London, Hong Kong, Bangkok and Tokyo.

From the web site design, one could quickly associate the hotel with luxury and an oriental motivation. The reservation process was easy as there was an indication bar showing the steps involved at the top of the reservation page. The web site also offered Welcoming options where customers can choose from a list of service items such as welcome drink, dining and city tour.

Upon completing the reservation, a confirmation email was sent which detailed out the basic information about the reservation. A few days prior to the arrival of guests, an email signed by the hotel manager was sent out to welcome the guest as well as offering

supplementary services such as in-room massage, use of business lounge and dining at hotel restaurants.

The hotel ambience appropriately reinforced the impression reflected by the hotel web site – luxury with an oriental touch. At the registration counter, the representative had asked for the guest ID. Interestingly, the representative welcomed the researcher and acknowledged that the visit was the first visit to the hotel. When asked if there was any membership card offered by the hotel, the representative replied,

“No, we do not have one”.

What was illustrated in the hotel web site was exactly how the guest room looked like. Unexpectedly but pleasant, the deluxe room has a walk-in closet and the amenities provided were from a higher-end class. Included in the room package was complimentary buffet breakfast for two adult. The next morning, at the restaurant as normally practiced by most hotels, the receptionist asked for the room number and ushered the researcher to the dining table. After being seated, the researcher proceeded to the buffet bar. While enjoying the American breakfast one of the waitress came up to the researcher and greeted by addressing the researcher by his full name and said,

“If you would like to order for anything on the menu please let me know”.

Of course it came as a surprise - the researcher was elated by the experience which never happened at other hotels he visited. After several days, the hotel sent out an email inviting guest feedback from the recent stay. From then onwards promotional emails were sent on a regular basis based on guests' past transactions.

A second visit was conducted four months after the first. In the repeat visit the reservation process and room package were the same. Upon checking the guest ID, the front-desk representative uttered,

“Welcome back! Our record shows that you have been with us before and this time, the manager would like to offer a complimentary upgrade for you today. Your room has been upgraded to a Suite room, on the house.”

Immediately, that particular offer elated the researcher. It was a memorable gesture and such encounters may shape customer's perception - the hotel service exceeds customer expectation and that the brand is at the forefront in creating customers value.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

From the structured observation carried out at five hotels, three hotels namely: Hotel A, Hotel B and Hotel D were rated as Moderately Integrated. These hotels met all the requirements i.e information displayed on the web sites matched the expectations of guests. There was no element of emotional appeal that would entice guests to return nor was there any element of disconfirmation of expectation.

Specifically, Hotel A was consistent in giving messages on promotional items however failed to track customers' past transactions data. Hotel A should be advised to take caution of customers who seek special treatment by means of reward or gesture of acknowledgment of their loyalty. A four-star hotel such as Hotel A should be wary of competition and actions that indicate lag in appreciating loyalty may cause customers switching to other players.

Unexpectedly, a five-star hotel such as Hotel C was poor in integrating its CRM. Inconsistency is detrimental to the hotel's reputation which may be labeled as unreliable. Hotel C should be strongly advised to rethink its CRM strategy as it appeared to be far from a customer-centric service organization. Although the hotel has won numerous awards but

customers unpleasant experience and frustration would spread the negative vibes at a lightning speed over the social media. In this case, the impact of viral marketing would be adversely affecting its brand.

Elements of emotional appeal such as feeling elated, surprised by an event that is memorable from a customer's point of view certainly have taken customers experience to the next level. Immediately customers form a positive perception of the hotel's service quality as creating value which is essential in building a long term relationship. Hotel E benefits from these experiences as the power of words of mouth goes a long way - viral marketing from existing customers is more effective than that of from the company itself.

Nevertheless, reinforcement of customers experience is vital. Interestingly, although Hotel E does not offer any membership programme it keeps the communication with customers alive through constantly sending them promotional emails close to customers' interests. This can be seen as a creative way of attracting return visits – a gesture of longing to maintain a relationship simply by tracking customers email address and analysis of customers preferences from his/her previous visits. With such experiences Hotel E would be able to sustain loyalty and hence its CRM practice is categorized as Well Integrated. Table 3 (see Appendix) summarizes the findings of this study.

This study is subjected to several limitations. The purpose of this study was to ascertain the CRM initiatives and how hoteliers relate technology-based CRM into the total customer experience. Due to limited literature on the reality of integrated CRM and how CRM practices affect customers experience from a hotel industry perspective a structured observation method was applied. The findings may be used an exploratory data for further in-depth qualitative studies such as using interviews and focus groups. Also, due to time constraints the observations were carried out only at five hotels in Kuala Lumpur. Therefore, generalization of the findings reflects the CRM implementation by all hotels in Malaysia is cautioned.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Sincere appreciation goes to the Ministry of Higher Education (MOHE), Malaysia, for the financial support provided through the Fundamental Research Grant Scheme (FRGS). The much needed support has enabled the researchers to pursue their goals and meet the objectives of this study. Appreciation also goes to Universiti Tun Abdul Razak, UNITAR International University and Asia Pacific University, in providing facilities during the conduct of this research. Last but not least, all the participants involved in the collection of data and support from families, friends and colleagues.

REFERENCES

- Ab Hamid, N.R., Cheng, A.W., & Akhir, R.M. (2011). Dimensions of E-CRM: An Empirical Study on Hotels' Web Sites, *Journal of Southeast Asian Research*, 2011.
- Ab Hamid, N.R. & Khatibi, A. (2007). The Importance of Emotional Features in Web-Based CRM System, *2007 IRMA International Conference*, 19-23 March 2007, Vancouver, CANADA, pp. 454-457.
- Ab Hamid, N.R. & McGrath, G.M. (2005). The Diffusion of Internet Interactivity on Retail Web Sites: A Customer Relationship Model, *Communications of the IIMA*, 5(2), 35-46.
- Anonymous (2006). Building loyalty by creating positive customer experiences, *Teller Vision*, August, 2-3.

- Bradshaw, D. & Brash, C. (2001). Managing customer relationships in the e-business world: How to personalize computer relationships for increased profitability', *International Journal of Retail and Distribution Management*, 29, 520-529.
- Brandweiner, N. (2012). Channel Integration and the Customer Experience: What's Going Wrong? Retrieved from <http://www.mycustomer.com>
- Croen, R. (2001). Speech recognition: The future of Customer Relationship Management (CRM). Retrieved at <http://www.loyalty.com>.
- Davenport, T & Beck, J. (2002). *The attention economy: Understanding the new currency of business*. Harvard Business School Press.
- Davey, N. (2011) Is CRM Killing Customer Experience Management? Retrieved from <http://www.mycustomer.com>
- Dewey, J. (1963). *Experience and education*. Collier Books, New York.
- Gobe, M., & Zyman, S. (2001). *Emotional branding: The new paradigm for connecting brands to people*. Allworth Press, New York.
- Gulati, R. & Garino, J. (2000). Get the right mix of bricks & clicks, *Harvard Business Review*, May, 107-114.
- Heckmann, P., Kesteloo, M., Schmaus, B., & Huisman, R. (2012). Cross-Channel Integration in Retail Creating a Seamless Customer Experience. Retrieved from <http://www.booz.com>
- Huseby, T., Lala, S. & Pressman, A. (2012) Engaging Multichannel Customers. Retrieved from <http://www.atkearney.com>
- James, D. (2000). Synchronizing the elements, *Marketing News Magazine*.
- Jacques, D. (2012). Where Does Customers Experience Fit in an Organization? Retrieved at <http://www.customerinput.com>
- Markwick, N. (2006). Creating a sense of belonging works for customers online, *Revolution*, September, 82.
- McLellan, H (2000). Experience design. *Cyberpsychology & Behavior*, 3, 59-69.
- Mulhall, A. (2003). In the field: notes on observation in qualitative research. *Journal of Advanced Nursing*, 41(3), 306–313.
- Price, L., Arnold, L., & Tierney, P. (1995). Going to extremes: Managing service encounters and assessing provider performance, *Journal of Marketing*, 59, 83-97.
- Pullman, ME. & Gross, MA (2004). Ability of experience design elements to elicit emotions and loyalty behaviours, *Decision Sciences*, Summer, 35, 551-578.
- Schmitt, B. (1999). *Experiential marketing*, The Free Press, New York.
- Wilson, T.D. (nd). A Case Study in Qualitative Research? *Social Science Information Studies*, 1, 241-146.
- Wolf, M.J. (1999). *The entertainment economy-How mega-media forces are transforming our lives*, Times Books, New York.
- Xu, Y., Yen, D. C., Lin, B., & Chou, D. C. (2002). Adopting customer relationship management technology, *Industrial Management & Data System*, 102, 442-52.
- Yakhlef, A. (2001). Does the Internet compete with or complement bricks-and-mortar bank branches?, *International Journal of Retail & Distribution Management*, 29(6), 272-281.

APPENDIX

Table 1: Elements and categories on integrated CRM programme

Elements	Description
Consistency	Same message/information across channels
Integrated CRM system	Tracking of customers' information across channels
Value-added services	Exceed expectation services, create excitement and memorable
Categories	
Description	Description
Well integrated	All 3 elements are present – customers feel excited to return due to services that exceed expectation
Moderately integrated	Some of the elements are present – satisfied and met expectation
Poorly integrated	Lacking; Disconfirmation of expectation

Table 2: Elements and observed items used in the study

Elements	Description	Observed Items
Consistency	Same message/information across channels	Facilities, amenities, ambience and promotional offers described in the hotel web site are consistent with the actual guest experience
Integrated CRM system	Tracking of customers' information across channels	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reservation confirmation email - Front desk system tracks accurate customers data - Retrieve historical data - Analyse data and share information across channels
Value-added services	Exceed expectation services, create excitement and memorable	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Welcome email from hotel's manager - Offer special services – cross-sell - Elements of surprise/emotional appeal

Table 3: Summary of study findings

Hotel Name	Observed Items	Yes/No (√/×)	Category
Hotel A	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilities and amenities; - Ambience; - promotional offers; <p>described in the hotel web site are consistent with the actual guest experience</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ √ √ 	Moderately Integrated
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reservation confirmation email - Front desk system tracks accurate customers data - Retrieve historical data - Analyse data and share information across channels 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ × × × 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Welcome email from hotel's manager - Offer special services – cross-sell - Elements of surprise/emotional appeal - Disconfirmation of expectation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ × × × 	
Hotel B	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilities and amenities; - Ambience; - promotional offers; <p>described in the hotel web site are consistent with the actual guest experience</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ √ √ 	Moderately Integrated
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reservation confirmation email - Front desk system tracks accurate customers data - Retrieve historical data - Analyse data and share information across channels 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ √ √ √ 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Welcome email from hotel's manager - Offer special services – cross-sell - Elements of surprise/emotional appeal - Disconfirmation of expectation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ × × × 	
Hotel C	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilities and amenities; 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ 	Poorly

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Ambience; - promotional offers; <p>described in the hotel web site are consistent with the actual guest experience</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ × 	Integrated
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reservation confirmation email - Front desk system tracks accurate customers data - Retrieve historical data - Analyse data and share information across channels 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ × × × 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Welcome email from hotel's manager - Offer special services – cross-sell - Elements of surprise/emotional appeal - Disconfirmation of expectation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ × × √ 	
Hotel D	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilities and amenities; - Ambience; - promotional offers; <p>described in the hotel web site are consistent with the actual guest experience</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ √ √ 	Moderately Integrated
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Reservation confirmation email - Front desk system tracks accurate customers data - Retrieve historical data - Analyse data and share information across channels 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ √ √ √ 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Welcome email from hotel's manager - Offer special services – cross-sell - Elements of surprise/emotional appeal - Disconfirmation of expectation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ √ × × 	
Hotel E	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Facilities and amenities; - Ambience; - promotional offers; <p>described in the hotel web site are consistent with the actual guest</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> √ √ √ 	Well Integrated

	experience		
	- Reservation confirmation email	√	
	- Front desk system tracks accurate customers data	√	
	- Retrieve historical data	√	
	- Analyse data and share information across channels	√	
	- Welcome email from hotel's manager	√	
	- Offer special services – cross-sell	√	
	- Elements of surprise/emotional appeal	√	
	- Disconfirmation of expectation	×	

